

## **Evidence Summary:** Diagnosing Borderline Personality Disorder (BPD) in Adolescence: What are the Issues and what is the Evidence?



# Evidence Summary:

## Diagnosing Borderline Personality Disorder (BPD) in Adolescence: What are the Issues and what is the Evidence?

### What is a personality disorder?

We all have a unique set of personality traits that characterise us. These are the usual ways that we perceive, think, feel, behave and relate to others and they tend to be consistent across time and situations. **Personality traits become 'disordered' when they are extreme, inflexible and maladaptive, causing significant distress and disruption to an individual's life or to those around them** (e.g. their ability to work, go to school or to maintain relationships).

It has long been assumed that both personality and personality disorders (PDs) are stable and enduring in their course from the end of adolescence (1). However, the evidence suggests otherwise (1-3). In fact, both normal and disordered personality remain relatively fluid over the first three to five decades of life. **This widespread misunderstanding reinforces the inaccurate belief of many health professionals that PDs cannot be diagnosed until adult life and that they are 'untreatable'.** This belief is especially common among clinicians in relation to borderline personality disorder (BPD), the most common PD in clinical practice (4).

### Is it permissible to diagnose PDs in adolescents?

Mental health professionals often believe that the current diagnostic systems in psychiatry (e.g. DSM-5; 5) do not allow them to diagnose PDs prior to age 18. This is incorrect (6). **DSM-5 (5) allows for the diagnosis of PDs (with the exception of antisocial personality disorder) in adolescence if the symptoms are severe enough to persistently interfere with the individual's daily functioning for one year or longer.** The DSM-5 (5) also describes an alternate system for diagnosing personality disorders that incorporated evidence for PDs in young people and recognises the dimensional nature of the disorder across the lifespan.

### What is BPD and how prevalent is it in adolescent populations?

BPD is characterised by a pervasive pattern of emotional instability, poor impulse control, difficulty managing interpersonal relationships and disturbed self-image (5). Clinical signs of the disorder include unstable moods, impulsive aggression, chronic suicidality, repeated self-injury, and interpersonal chaos (7).

Research suggests that BPD is not uncommon in adolescents. **It has been argued that it is primarily a disorder of young people, as BPD traits in young people appear to be at least as high, if not substantially higher, than in adults** (8, 9). In community settings, BPD is estimated to affect about 3% of adolescents (10,11), while in clinical settings it is higher, ranging between 11% (of adolescent outpatients; 9,12) up to 50% (of adolescent inpatients; 12).

While adolescents with BPD might seek professional help, there is often a considerable delay between the onset of symptoms, help-seeking behaviour (13) and recognition of the disorder (14,15). Controversy about diagnosing BPD in this age group and the stigma that surrounds the disorder contribute to **low detection rates and reluctance among clinicians to diagnose in adolescence** (6,16). When adolescents do come into contact with mental health services, personality disorder is infrequently assessed, resulting in the majority of cases of BPD going unrecognised. As a result the opportunities for intervention are often lost (17,18). With early detection and intervention for BPD now justified and practical in adolescence (8) and supported by national clinical guidelines (19,20), **ignoring the possibility of BPD as a clinical reality among adolescent clients might hamper effective clinical treatment** (6,21-22).

### Can BPD be distinguished from 'normal' adolescent behaviour?

The stereotype of adolescents being moody, disruptive and difficult to deal with might lead to the inaccurate perception that all young people have BPD traits. **It is the number and pervasiveness of the problems that distinguishes BPD from normal adolescence.** The associated level of pain and desperation and the high suicide risk lie far outside the experience of a typically 'stormy' adolescence (23). **With training, mental health professionals can distinguish between normal development and the characteristics of BPD** (6).

### Is it valid to diagnose BPD in adolescence?

Much of the controversy surrounding diagnosing BPD (and other PDs) in adolescence has centred on concerns as to whether it is valid to diagnose PDs in adolescence. A diagnosis of adolescent BPD has strong concurrent validity (i.e. it is associated with high levels of current distress and impaired functioning), divergent validity (i.e. it can be reliably measured on more than one scale) and construct validity (i.e. the features of BPD diagnosis in adolescents are comparable to those of adults; 6,24,25). A recent systematic review [26] has also supported the predictive validity of the diagnosis (i.e. the stability of the diagnosis over time and the associated long-term functional outcomes). The diagnostic stability of BPD in adolescents is consistent with that of adults and it is predictive of significant negative functional outcomes up to 20 years later (26,27).

**The 20-year longitudinal study provides strong support for the argument that borderline symptoms in adolescence cannot be considered a developmental stage that passes** (23).

# Evidence Summary:

## Diagnosing Borderline Personality Disorder (BPD) in Adolescence: What are the Issues and what is the Evidence?

BPD during adolescence defines a group of young people with more severe symptoms and lower levels of functioning than those with other types of personality disorder or no PD (21). The negative outcomes associated with elevated BPD symptoms in adolescence appear to persist well beyond the adolescent years, extending to a wide range of functional and clinical outcomes. Higher levels of BPD symptoms in early adolescence are predictive of increased risk of a diagnosis of BPD in adulthood, developing other mental disorders, experiencing significant interpersonal problems, distress and reduced quality of life through the 20s and 30s. These problems occur independent of other mental disorders in adolescence and persist even after individuals no longer meet criteria for BPD (23).

Longitudinal data suggest that BPD tends to become clinically apparent during adolescence, peaks in young adulthood, and attenuates in a linear fashion over the rest of the lifespan (8). **Regardless of whether or not the diagnosis of BPD is maintained into adulthood, adolescent BPD warrants intervention.** Adolescents with elevated BPD symptoms are at current risk of suicidal behaviour and report intense emotional pain and distress (28-29). Moreover, while remission of the BPD diagnosis is common in the transition to adulthood, this does not necessarily imply full recovery - there is often a need for ongoing support even when a young person no longer meets diagnostic criteria (7).

### Can a diagnosis of BPD in adolescence be harmful?

Another controversial aspect about diagnosing BPD in adolescence is the risk that a diagnosis – or label - will ‘stick’ and haunt the person long after the symptoms have ended (30). Unfortunately a diagnosis of BPD can still lead to rejection by the health system (31), as clients are often seen as “too difficult”. For this reason, health professionals might have legitimate concerns about stigma and ‘labelling’ an adolescent with BPD (2,8,30). **These concerns should encourage better education and training of professionals but should not prevent mental health professionals from accurately assessing borderline symptoms in adolescents and diagnosing BPD where appropriate (2,8,6), as accurate diagnosis is necessary for appropriate intervention.**

In the absence of appropriate assessment, adolescents with BPD either go without treatment or are misdiagnosed. Substituting other diagnoses (e.g., adjustment disorders, bipolar disorder) is inappropriate and unjustified (21) and is likely to lead to the application of inappropriate interventions (8,23). Without appropriate intervention, adolescents with BPD are likely to experience persistent difficulties that have major developmental effects, increasing their sense of despair and hopelessness.

### What is the prognosis for adolescents with BPD?

Although BPD is prospectively associated with major problems and a suicide rate of 10% (28), even after individuals no longer meet criteria for the diagnosis, evidence suggests that the natural tendency of BPD is toward improvement (32) and psychotherapy can speed up this process. Furthermore, effective specialised treatments for BPD in adolescence (33) and treatments aimed at self-harm and suicidality in adolescence [34,35] are now emerging.

### What does this all mean for mental health professionals who work with young people?

A diagnosis of BPD can be made with reasonable confidence when an adolescent aged 12-18 years meets diagnostic criteria for BPD (19). **The available evidence indicates that the BPD diagnosis is as reliable and valid in adolescents as it is in adults (2,6).** A carefully conducted and appropriate diagnosis of BPD, based upon the DSM-5 criteria, assists the clinician, the client and his/her family and significant others to make sense of what can be a confusing and distressing situation and also helps to plan appropriate interventions to reduce the current and future problems associated with the disorder.

Clinical experts recommend that when young clients present with symptoms suggestive of BPD, it is necessary to weigh the potential benefits of a diagnosis against the potential risks of early stigmatisation, and that the appropriate response to stigmatisation is improved training for professionals (2). A diagnosis of BPD should not be made in order to exclude individuals from care. **Where a diagnosis is made, caution should be exercised to ensure that it is accurate.** There is concern that some clinicians regard BPD as a convenient diagnosis for clients who are simply difficult to treat. **Clinicians must conduct appropriate assessments, particularly avoiding labelling all adolescents who self-harm as having BPD.**

In line with clinical guidelines [19], it has been argued in the literature on adult BPD that if a diagnosis is made there are compelling reasons to openly discuss the BPD diagnosis with the client and to provide both the client and his/her family with accurate psycho-education to dispel any myths they might have (7,31,36,37). A randomised controlled trial found that psychoeducation led to short-term symptomatic improvements in adults (38). Young people often experience relief when they learn that the difficulties they have been experiencing can be attributed to an identified syndrome and that effective treatment is available, and clinical experts have advised that a diagnosis should be openly discussed and psycho-education provided to adolescents and their families (39).

# Evidence Summary:

## Diagnosing Borderline Personality Disorder (BPD) in Adolescence: What are the Issues and what is the Evidence?

### Other Resources

#### **www.neabpd.org:**

A useful American website featuring articles, video and audio commentaries from several leading international experts on BPD

**www.bpddemystified.com:** Another useful American website

#### **NHMRC guidelines**

<https://www.nhmrc.gov.au/guidelines-publications/mh25>

#### **BPD, Stigma and Young People:**

<https://orygen.org.au/Our-Research/Research-Areas/Personality-Disorder/Research-Bulletin-BPD.aspx>

#### **BPD and Young People:**

[http://oyh.org.au/sites/oyh.org.au/files/factsheets/oyh\\_fs\\_bord.pdf](http://oyh.org.au/sites/oyh.org.au/files/factsheets/oyh_fs_bord.pdf) A factsheet for young people and their families/carers

#### **Engaging and managing an unwilling or aggressive young person:**

[http://mja.com.au/public/issues/187\\_07\\_011007/mcc10287\\_fm.html](http://mja.com.au/public/issues/187_07_011007/mcc10287_fm.html) practical tips for professionals working with young people on how to manage challenges in engagement and treatment

#### **What to do when your Teen has BPD: A Complete Guide For Families**

[http://www.amazon.com/Borderline-Personality-Disorder-Adolescents-2nd/dp/1592336493/ref=sr\\_1\\_1?s=books&ie=UTF8&qid=1461730900&sr=21-1&keywords=Borderline+Personality+Disorder+in+Adolescents%3A](http://www.amazon.com/Borderline-Personality-Disorder-Adolescents-2nd/dp/1592336493/ref=sr_1_1?s=books&ie=UTF8&qid=1461730900&sr=21-1&keywords=Borderline+Personality+Disorder+in+Adolescents%3A)

### References

1. Lenzeweger M.E. & Castro D.D. (2005). Predicting change in borderline personality: Using neurobehavioral systems indicators within an individual growth curve framework. *Development and Psychopathology*, 17: p.1207-1237.
2. Chanen A.M., Jovev M., McCutcheon L.K., Jackson H.J. & McGorry P.D. (2008) Borderline personality disorder in young people and the prospects for prevention and early intervention. *Current Psychiatry Reviews*, 4: p.48-57.
3. Caspi, A., Roberts, B. W., & Shiner, R. L. (2005). Personality Development: Stability and Change. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 56: p.453-484.
4. Kaess, M., Brunner, R., & Chanen, A. (2014). Borderline personality disorder in adolescence. *Pediatrics*, 134(4), 782-793.
5. American Psychiatric Association (2013). *Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders: DSM-5*. Washington, D.C: American Psychiatric Association.
6. Miller A.L., Muehlenkamp J.J. & Jacobson C.M. (2008). Fact or fiction: Diagnosing borderline personality disorder in adolescents. *Clinical Psychology Review*, 28: p.969-981.
7. Lieb K., Zanarini M.C., Schmahl C., Linehan M.M. & Bohus M. (2004). Borderline personality disorder. *Lancet*, 364: p.453-461.
8. Chanen, A. M., & McCutcheon, L. (2013). Prevention and early intervention for borderline personality disorder: current status and recent evidence. *The British Journal of Psychiatry*, 202(s54), s24-s29.
9. Chanen, A. M., Jovev M., Djaja D., McDougall E., Yuen H.P., Rawlings D. & Jackson H.J. (2008). Screening for borderline personality disorder in outpatient youth. *Journal of personality disorders*, 22(4), 353-364.
10. Bernstein D. P., Cohen P., Velez C.N., Schwab-Stone M., Siever L.J., Shinsato L. (1993). Prevalence and stability of the DSM-III-R personality disorders in a community-based survey of adolescents. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 150:p.1237-43.
11. Moran P., Coffey C., Mann A., Carlin J.B., Patton G.C. (2006). Personality and substance use disorders in young adults. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 188: p.374-9.
12. Chanen, A. M., Jackson, H. J., McGorry, P. D., & Allot, K. A. (2004). Two-year stability of personality disorder in older adolescent outpatients. *Journal of personality disorders*, 18(6), 526.
13. Paris J. (2005). The development of impulsivity and suicidality in borderline personality disorder. *Developmental Psychopathology*, 17: p.1091-1094.
14. Zanarini M.C., Frankenburg F.R., Khera G.S. & Bleichmar J. (2001). Treatment histories of borderline inpatients. *Comprehensive Psychiatry*, 42(2): p. 144-150.
15. Clarkin J.F., Levy K.N., Lenzeweger M.F., Kernberg O.F. (2004). The Personality Disorders Institute/Borderline Personality Disorder Research Foundation randomized control trial for borderline personality disorder: rationale, methods, and patient characteristics. *Journal of Personality Disorders*, 18: p.52-72.
16. Zanarini M.C. (2008). Reasons for change in borderline personality disorder (and other Axis II Disorders). *Psychiatric Clinics of North America*, 31: p.505-515.
17. Chanen A.M, McCutcheon L.K., Jovev M., Jackson H.J. & McGorry P. (2007) Prevention and early intervention for borderline personality disorder. *Medical Journal of Australia*, 187(7): p. S18-S21.
18. Vizard, E. (2008) Emerging severe personality disorder in childhood. Approaches to treatment. *Psychiatry*, 7(9): p.389-394.
19. National Health and Medical Research Council. *Clinical Practice Guideline for the Management of Borderline Personality Disorder*. Melbourne: National Health and Medical Research Council; 2012.
20. National Institute for Clinical Excellence (2009). *Borderline personality disorder - treatment and management*. NICE clinical guideline 78. London, UK. Available at <http://guidance.nice.org.uk/CG78>.

# Evidence Summary:

## Diagnosing Borderline Personality Disorder (BPD) in Adolescence: What are the Issues and what is the Evidence?

21. Chanen A.M., Jovev M., & Jackson H.J. (2007). Adaptive Functioning and Psychiatric Symptoms in Adolescents With Borderline Personality Disorder. *Journal of Clinical Psychiatry*, 68: p.297-306.
22. Chanen, A. M., Jackson, H. J., McCutcheon, L., Dudgeon, P., Jovev, M., Yuen, H. P., Weinstein, C., McDougall, E., Clarkson, V., Germano, D., Nistico, H., & McGorry, P. D. (2008). Early intervention for adolescents with borderline personality disorder using Cognitive Analytic Therapy: a randomised controlled trial. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 193(6): p.477-484.
23. Winograd, G., Cohen, P., & Chen, H. (2008). Adolescent borderline symptoms in the community: prognosis for functioning over 20 years. *Journal of Clinical Psychiatry*, 68(2): p.297-306.
24. Bondurant H., Greenfield B. & Man Tse S. (2004) Construct validity of the adolescent Borderline Personality Disorder: A Review. *Canadian Child and Adolescent Psychiatry Review*, 13(3): p.53-57.
25. Winsper, C., Lereya, S. T., Marwaha, S., Thompson, A., Eyden, J., & Singh, S. P. (2016). The aetiological and psychopathological validity of borderline personality disorder in youth: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Clinical psychology review*, 44, 13-24.
26. Winsper, C., Marwaha, S., Lereya, S. T., Thompson, A., Eyden, J., & Singh, S. P. (2015). Clinical and psychosocial outcomes of borderline personality disorder in childhood and adolescence: a systematic review. *Psychological medicine*, 45(11), 2237-2251.
27. Newton-Howes, G., Clark, L.A., & Chanen, A. (2015). Personality disorder across the life course. *The Lancet*, 385(9969), 727-734.
28. Pompili M., Girardi P., Ruberto A., & Tatarelli R. (2005). Suicide in borderline personality disorder: A meta-analysis. *Nordic Journal of Psychiatry*, 59(5): p.319-324.
29. Bradley R., Conklin C.Z. & Westen D. (2005) The borderline personality diagnosis in adolescents: gender differences and subtypes. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, 46(9): p. 1006-1019.
30. Silk K. (2008). Commentary Personality disorder in adolescence: The diagnosis that dare not speak its name. *Personality and Mental Health*, 2: p.46-48.
31. Paris J. (2005). The diagnosis of borderline personality disorder: problematic but better than the alternatives. *Annals of Clinical Psychiatry*, 17(1): p.41-46.
32. Paris J. (2008). Clinical trials of treatment for personality disorders. *Psychiatric Clinics of North America*, 31: p.517-526.
33. Chanen, A. M., Jackson, H. J., McCutcheon, L. K., Jovev, M., Dudgeon, P., Yuen, H. P., ... & Clarkson, V. (2009). Early intervention for adolescents with borderline personality disorder: quasi-experimental comparison with treatment as usual. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*, 43, 397-408.
34. MacPherson, H. A., Cheavens, J. S., & Fristad, M. A. (2013). Dialectical behavior therapy for adolescents: theory, treatment adaptations, and empirical outcomes. *Clinical child and family psychology review*, 16(1), 59-80.
35. Rossouw, T. I., & Fonagy, P. (2012). Mentalization-based treatment for self-harm in adolescents: a randomized controlled trial. *Journal of the American Academy of Child & Adolescent Psychiatry*, 51(12), 1304-1313
36. Skodol A.E., Johnson J.G., Cohen P., Sneed J.R. & Crawford T.N. (2007). Personality disorder and impaired functioning from adolescence to adulthood. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 190: p.415-420.
37. Hersh R. (2008) Confronting myths and stereotypes about borderline personality disorder. *Social Work in Mental Health*, 6 (1/2): p.13-32.
38. Zanarini, M. C., & Frankenburg, F. R. (2008). A Preliminary, Randomized Trial of Psychoeducation for Women With Borderline Personality Disorder. *Journal of Personality Disorders*, 22(3): p.284-320.
39. Chanen, A. M., McCutcheon, L., Germano, D., Nistico, H., Jackson, H. J., & McGorry, P. D. (2009). The HYPE Clinic: An Early Intervention Service for Borderline Personality Disorder. *Journal of Psychiatric Practice*, 15(3): p.163-172.

## Acknowledgements

**headspace** Evidence Summaries are prepared by the Centre of Excellence in Youth Mental Health. The series aims to highlight for service providers the research evidence and best practices for the care of young people with mental health and substance abuse problems. The content is based on the best available evidence that has been appraised for quality. Experts on the topic have reviewed the summary before publication, including members of the **headspace** Youth National Reference Group (hYNRG). The authors would like to thank the members of hYNRG for their input on this Evidence Summary.

### MythBuster Writers

Dr. Faye Scanlan

Assoc. Prof. Rosemary Purcell

Orygen, The National Centre for Youth Mental Health

### Clinical Consultants

Prof. Andrew Chanen

Prof. Patrick McGorry

Prof. Alison Yung

Orygen, The National Centre for Youth Mental Health

**headspace** National Youth Mental Health Foundation Ltd. is funded by the Australian Government Department of Health under the Youth Mental Health Initiative Program.

For more details about **headspace** visit [headspace.org.au](http://headspace.org.au)

Copyright © Orygen, The National Centre of Excellence in Youth Mental Health

This work is copyrighted. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part may be reproduced without prior written permission from Orygen, the National Centre of Excellence in Youth Mental Health

Online: 978-1-925157-10-9

**headspace National Office**

**p** +61 3 9027 0100 **f** +61 3 9027 0199

[info@headspace.org.au](mailto:info@headspace.org.au)

[headspace.org.au](http://headspace.org.au)